

CCMG Endorsement Policy and Process

Author: CCMG Policy and Bylaws Committee

Approved by the CCMG Board of Directors: December 7, 2018

Purpose: The purpose of this document is to provide the process for endorsement of documents produced by other organizations by the Canadian College of Medical Geneticists (CCMG) to ensure a consistent, responsive and efficient approach.

Step	Action	Person(s) Responsible
1.	CCMG office receives a request to endorse a statement/guideline, and forwards to CCMG President.	CCMG Manager President
2.	Within 5 working days, President considers length and scope of document and decides on maximum TAT for response – not to exceed 2 months. President directs Manager to acknowledge request (template letter A): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Thank requestor for seeking CCMG endorsement b) Inform requestor that the CCMG has a formal process for endorsement that is designed to occur as efficiently as possible, but could take up to <i>DATE decided by President</i>, depending on the length of time needed to review the document, availability of committee members and review and approval by the Board of Directors. 	CCMG Manager President
3.	CCMG Manager informs CCMG Board members for need to review document for which endorsement was requested, and sends/posts document for review.	CCMG Manager
4.	Within 2 weeks of the request, statement/guideline will be reviewed by a majority of Directors with the sole purpose of reaching a decision if the document is suitable for CCMG review for endorsement, as based on: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Content falls within purview of the CCMG b) Content is appropriate for consideration This should not require a detailed read, but instead a cursory review.	CCMG Board
5.	If unsuitable for endorsement (outside the purview of the CCMG and/or inappropriate), Board will direct CCMG manager to promptly send a letter back to requestor (template letter B with appropriate wording).	CCMG Board CCMG Manager President
6.	If suitable for endorsement, the Board will identify the committee(s) with the appropriate expertise to review.	CCMG Board Committee BoD

	The Board notifies the committee Chair(s) via the BoD representative of need for review with a deadline of 4 weeks (the realistic intention being a response in 5-6 weeks).	Representative President	
7.	Manager will enable access to the document control system for the relevant committee(s).	CCMG Manager	
8.	Chair(s) will use document control system and/or teleconferencing to accomplish a timely review. Committee review: The review process should include review of each recommendation of the document, to determine whether each recommendation can be endorsed, endorsed with changes, or rejected. This determination will be based on the agreement of the committee members with the available evidence in the guideline and other sources, and if applicable, acceptable and feasible for implementation in the Canadian context and as relevant to the CCMG existing documents. A table with recommendations requiring caveats or clarifications should be produced – see Table 1.	Relevant Committee(s)	
9.	At completion of the committee review, one of four recommendations will be provided to the Board via the BoD representative: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Endorse without further revision b) Endorse with minor revisions (minor revisions provided in Table 1) c) Endorsement cannot be considered without major revisions (Table 1 should outline major issues noted in the document) d) Endorsement cannot be offered 	Relevant Committee(s) Committee BoD Representative	
10.	The Board will review and decision made as to accept or reject committee recommendation. This may be done via email of the BoD members or on a BoD call. Possible outcomes include:	CCMG Board CCMG Manager President	
	IF		THEN
	Endorse without further revision		Board will direct Manager to send template letter C

	Endorse with minor revisions	Board will direct the Manger to send template letter D, along with a list of suggested revisions (Table 1)	
	Endorsement cannot be considered without major revisions	Board will direct Manager to send template letter E.	
	Endorsement cannot be offered	Board will direct Manager to send template letter B (with appropriate wording).	
11.	The template letters C and D to the requesting organization will also include preferred wording for a comment to be added to the manuscript regarding CCMG endorsement, as outlined in the current CCMG Document Style guidelines.		
12.	The final decision of the Board and the outcome (as per step 11) will be transmitted back to the committee Chairs by the BoD representative and/or President.		Committee BoD Representative President
13.	The Board may choose to reject the committee recommendation. This is only likely to occur under compelling circumstances. If it occurs, the Board should communicate with the committee Chair to thank the committee for their recommendation and briefly explain the rationale for the Board’s decision. This should be done as a fait accompli – rather than encouraging further deliberation between Board and the committee, which prolongs the process and does not necessarily result in consensus. The Board has the final word and needs to “own” the right to override the recommendation.		
14.	In some cases, endorsement of a document may be initiated internally, rather than at request of an external organization (for example, CCMG committee wishing to endorse a new ACMG document). In this scenario, a request for endorsement may be brought to the BoD by CCMG committee BoD representatives, Chairs, or CCMG members directly. For review of such requests, steps 4 to 10 will be followed, with next steps decided by the Board depending on the specific document (for example, the endorsed document may be posted on the CCMG website along with comments from review captured in Table 1).		

Table 1. Caveats and/or Clarifications of specific recommendations of document X, dated D/M/Y

Section	Recommendation as exists in document	Caveat/clarification for the Canadian and/or CCMG context
<i>Example:</i> Section 2.2 Use of control populations	<i>Example:</i> An allele frequency in a control population that is greater than expected for the disorder is considered strong support for a benign interpretation for a rare Mendelian disorder.	<i>Example:</i> For some disorders with founder populations in Canada, very high variant frequencies may exist. A statement to this effect should be added.

Template letter A (on CCMG letterhead)

Name, title and email address

Date

Dear *name*,

Thank you for requesting CCMG endorsement of _____. Your request has been forwarded to the Board of Directors. Within 14 working days, the Board will review your request to determine if it falls under the purview of the College. If not, we will be back in touch at that time. If so, the Board will send the document to the appropriate CCMG committee for their input. The committee will make one of four recommendations to the Board:

1. Endorse without further revision
2. Endorse with minor revisions
3. Endorsement requires major revisions and cannot be considered at this time
4. Endorsement cannot be offered

The Board will endeavor to inform you of their decision in a timely fashion. Taking into account the length of your document and the availability of our committee members, we anticipate responding to you by DATE _____

Thank you again for your request.

Yours sincerely,

H. Dow
CCMG Manger

Address

Phone

Email

Template letter B (on CCMG letterhead)

Name, title and email address

Date

Dear name:

Thank you for requesting CCMG endorsement of _____.

While we appreciate being contacted in this regard, it is the consensus of our Board of Directors that the subject matter *lies outside the purview of the CCMG OR is inconsistent with CCMG policies or principles*; therefore endorsement by our organization would not be appropriate.

We nonetheless appreciate your interest in our organization and we remain available to consider future endorsement requests.

Yours sincerely,

H. Dow
CCMG Manger

Address

Phone

Email

Template letter C (on CCMG letterhead)

Name, title and email address

Date

Dear *name*:

Thank you for requesting CCMG endorsement of _____.

The Board of Directors accepted the following recommendation from our committee review:

Endorse without further revision

That being the case, we are pleased to offer CCMG endorsement of the document in its current form, and would be happy to place a link to the finalized document on our website. Please contact our Management office should that be of interest.

Our preferred wording for the endorsement statement regarding the CCMG is _____.

Yours sincerely,

H. Dow
CCMG Manger

Address

Phone

Email

Template Letter D (on CCMG letterhead)

Name, title and email address

Date

Dear *name*:

Thank you for requesting CCMG endorsement of _____.

The Board of Directors accepted the following recommendation from our committee review:

Endorse with minor revisions

Attached please find our suggested modifications (**note - attach completed Table 1**) and the associated rationale. Kindly let us know if you intend to incorporate these suggestions. We would be happy to engage in further dialogue and/or answer any questions you may have.

Yours sincerely,

H. Dow
CCMG Manger

Address

Phone

Email

Template Letter E (on CCMG letterhead)

Name, title and email address

Date

Dear *name*:

Thank you for requesting CCMG endorsement of _____.

The Board of Directors accepted the following recommendation from our committee review:

Endorsement requires major revisions and cannot be considered at this time

Unfortunately, we feel that the document in its current form would not reflect the consensus of our membership. Please contact our Management office if you would like to work further with our XX committee and Board of Directors to achieve endorsement. We would be happy to engage in further dialogue and/or answer any questions you may have.

Yours sincerely,

H. Dow
CCMG Manger

Address

Phone

Email